

KINGS LAW REPORTS

(ALL SC/NOVEL CA)

(2013) KLR VOL 1 PART 322 pp. 1 - 288

JANUARY 2013

Dedicated to the King of kings

O. O. NOEL ESQ. Founder/Publisher

C. L. Onwuegbuna Esq. Chief Editor

INDEX OF CASES REPORTED

1. Achilihu v. Anyatonwu p. 1
2. Alims Nig. Ltd. v. United Bank for Africa p. 35
3. Audu v. Federal Republic of Nigeria p. 53
4. Inegbedion v. Selo-Ojemen p. 69
5. Intercontinental Bank Plc v. Olam Nig Ltd p. 89
6. Mohammed v. State p. 99
7. Mpama v. First Bank Nig. Plc p. 113
8. Nruamah v. Ebuzoeme p. 133
9. Odutola v. Mabogunje p. 161
10. Oshiomole v. Ehigie p. 191
11. Osuagwu v. State p. 223
12. Vab Petroleum Inc. v. Momah p. 249

JUSTICES OF THE SUPREME COURT OF NIGERIA

HON. JUSTICE ALOMA MARIAM MUKHTAR - CHIEF JUSTICE OF NIGERIA

HON. JUSTICE MAHMUD MOHAMMED

HON. JUSTICE WALTER SAMUEL NKANU ONNOGHEN

HON. JUSTICE IBRAHIM TANKO MUHAMMAD

HON. JUSTICE CHRISTOPHER M. CHUKWUMA-ENEH

HON. JUSTICE MUHAMMAD SAIFULLAH MUNTAKA-COOMASSIE

HON. JUSTICE JOHN AFOLABI FABIYI

HON. JUSTICE SULEIMAN GALADIMA

HON. JUSTICE BODE RHODES-VIVOUR

HON. JUSTICE NWALI SYLVESTER NGWUTA

HON. JUSTICE MARY UKAEGO PETER-ODILI

HON. JUSTICE OLUKAYODE ARIWOOLA

HON. JUSTICE MUSA DATIJO MUHAMMAD

HON. JUSTICE CLARA BATA OGUNBIYI

HON. JUSTICE KUMAI BAYANG AKA'AH

HON. JUSTICE STANLEY SHENKO ALAGOA

JUSTICES OF THE COURT OF APPEAL

THE HON. JUSTICE ZAINAB ADAMU BULKACHUWA

- ACTING PRESIDENT OF THE COURT OF APPEAL

LAGOS DIVISION

THE HON. JUSTICE AMINA ADAMU AUGIE

THE HON. JUSTICE IBRAHIM MOHAMMED SAULAWA

THE HON. JUSTICE CHIMA CENTUS NWEZE

THE HON. JUSTICE JOSEPH SHAGBAOR IKYEGH

THE HON. JUSTICE RITA NOSAKHARE PEMU

THE HON. JUSTICE CHINWE EUGENIA IYIZOBA

THE HON. JUSTICE FATIMA O. AKINBAMI

KADUNA DIVISION

THE HON. JUSTICE DALHATU ADAMU

THE HON. JUSTICE ABDU ABOKI

THE HON. JUSTICE THERESA NGOLIKA ORJ1-ABADUA

THE HON. JUSTICE ITA GEORGE MBABA

THE HON. JUSTICE H. A. ABIRU

ENUGU DIVISION

THE HON JUSTICE ABUBAKAR JEGA ABDULKADIR
THE HON. JUSTICE MOJEED ADEKUNLE OWOADE
THE HON. JUSTICE ISAIAH OLUFEMI AKEJU
THE HON. JUSTICE E. AGIM

IBADAN DIVISION

THE HON. JUSTICE MONICA B. DONGBAN-MENSEM
THE HON. JUSTICE CHIDI NWAOMA UWA
THE HON. JUSTICE ADAMU JAURO
THE HON. JUSTICE O.O. DANIEL-KALIO

BENIN DIVISION

THE HON. JUSTICE GEORGE OLADEINDE SHOREMI
THE HON. JUSTICE HELEN MORONKEJI OGUNWUMIJU
THE HON. JUSTICE SIDI DAUDA BAGE
THE HON. JUSTICE AYOBODE OLUJIMI LOKULO-SODIPE
THE HON. JUSTICE TOM SHAIBU YAKUBU

JOS DIVISION

THE HON. JUSTICE RAPHAEL CHIKWE AGBO
THE HON. JUSTICE OYEBISI FOLAYEMI OMOLEYE
THE HON. JUSTICE JUMMAI HANNATU SANKEY
THE HON. JUSTICE P. O. IGE
THE HON. JUSTICE I. S. BOLIYA

PORT HARCOURT DIVISION

THE HON. JUSTICE MOHAMMED LADAN TSAMIYA
THE HON. JUSTICE EJEMBI EKO
THE HON. JUSTICE CHIOMA EGONDU NWOSU-IHEME
THE HON. JUSTICE MODUPE FASANMI
THE HON. JUSTICE JONAH ADAH

ABUJA DIVISION

THE HON. JUSTICE AMIRU SANUSI
THE HON. JUSTICE ABUBAKAR DATTI YAHAYA

iv ***JUSTICES OF THE COURT OF APPEAL***

THE HON. JUSTICE REGINA OBIAGELI NWODO
THE HON. JUSTICE MOORE A. A. ADUMEIN
THE HON. JUSTICE T. AKOMOLAFE WILSON

CALABAR DIVISION

THE HON. JUSTICE MOHAMMAD LAWAL GARBA
THE HON. JUSTICE UZO I. NDUKWE-ANYANWU
THE HON. JUSTICE JOSEPH TINE TUR
THE HON. JUSTICE O. A. OTISI

ILORIN DIVISION

THE HON. JUSTICE PAUL ADAMU GALINJE
THE HON. JUSTICE HUSSEIN MUKHTAR
THE HON. JUSTICE OBANDE F. OGBUINYA
THE HON. JUSTICE T. ABUBAKAR

OWERRI DIVISION

HON. JUSTICE UWANI MUSA ABBA AJI
THE HON. JUSTICE JOHN INYANG OKORO
THE HON. JUSTICE PHILOMENA MBUA EKPE
THE HON. JUSTICE HARUNA MOHAMMED TSAMMANI

SOKOTO DIVISION

THE HON. JUSTICE TIJANI ABDULLAHI
THE HON. JUSTICE AHMAD OLAREWAJU BELGORE
THE HON. JUSTICE TUNDE OYEBANJI AWOTOYE
THE HON. JUSTICE J.S. ABIRIYI

YOLA DIVISION

THE HON. JUSTICE SOTONYE DENTON-WEST
THE HON. JUSTICE IGNATIUS IGWE AGUBE
THE HON. JUSTICE A. ALKALI ABBA

EKITI DIVISION

THE HON. JUSTICE JIMI OLUKAYODE BADA
THE HON. JUSTICE MASSOUD ABDULRAHMAN OREDOLA
THE HON. JUSTICE UCHECHUKWU ONYEMENAM

AKURE DIVISION

THE HON. JUSTICE KUDIRAT M.O. KEKERE-EKUN

THE HON. JUSTICE ALI A.B. GUMEL

THE HON. JUSTICE IFEOMA JUMBO-OFO

MAKURDI DIVISION

THE HON. JUSTICE JAFARU MIKA'ILU

THE HON. JUSTICE ADZIRA GANA MSHELIA

THE HON. JUSTICE SAMUELCHUKWUDUMEBI OSEJI

THE HON. JUSTICE MUHAMMAD AMB1-USI DANJUMA

INDEX OF SUBJECT MATTER IN (2013) 1 KLR

ACTIONS - Relief - Failure to claim - Since appellant never claimed for release of its title documents - Same was never decreed in its favour - As court does not grant relief not claimed (H8) Alims Nig. Ltd. v. United Bank for Africa p. 35

ADMINISTRATION OF ESTATES - Legal fees - Payment of - Legal fees of counsel are paid out of the estate of the deceased - Usually after counsel are heard (H7) Odotola v. Mabogunje p. 161

ADMINISTRATION OF ESTATES - Will - Testamentary capacity - It is presumed that deceased's mental capacity exists - Until the contrary is proved by plaintiff (H4) Odotola v. Mabogunje p. 161

AFFIDAVITS - Averments - Contradiction - Where a party does not file counter affidavit - To contradict averments in affidavit in support of motion - He is deemed to have admitted them (H2) Inegbedion v. Selo-Ojemen p. 69

APPEALS - Brief - Fair hearing - C.A. Rules O. 17 r. 5 - C.A. was wrong to hear the appeal and reserve judgment thereof - When the period given to appellant to file reply has not been determined (H2) Audu v. Federal Republic of Nigeria p. 53

vi ***INDEX OF SUBJECT MATTER IN (2013) 1 KLR***

APPEALS - Court - Findings of fact - Where Court of Appeal wrongly disturbed findings of trial court - Supreme Court will not hesitate in restoring the finding (H8) *Vab Petroleum Inc. v. Momah* p. 249

APPEALS - Court - Issues - *Suo motu* formulation - Appeal court can adopt issues *suo motu* - Provided such issues arise from valid grounds of appeal - And address the real grievance therein (H6) *Odutola v. Mabogunje* p. 161

APPEALS - Court - Record of appeal - Binding nature of - Appellate courts are not only bound by the record - But also bound to examine the state of same - On conflicting claims of parties (H1) *Audu v. Federal Republic of Nigeria* p. 53

APPEALS - Courts - Findings of fact - Appellate court should not interfere with findings of trial court - Save where there is misdirection by trial court (H6) *Achilihu v. Anyatonwu* p. 1

APPEALS - Criminal proceedings - Retrial order - Since the proceedings is nullity - The order is wrong and appellant whose conviction and sentence have been nullified - Shall be set free (H3) *Mohammed v. State* p. 99

APPEALS - Evidence - Reevaluation - Where trial court fails to properly evaluate evidence - Appeal court can reevaluate and make findings - Provided credibility of witnesses is not involved (H2) *Odutola v. Mabogunje* p. 161

APPEALS - Fresh issue - Grant of application to raise new points - Arising from grounds not covered in earlier notice of appeal - Would not be given - Save where the points are substantial - And not necessitating taking of fresh evidence (H1) *Intercontinental Bank Plc v. Olam Nig Ltd* p. 89

APPEALS - Ground - Issue - Formulation - Where no issue is formulated from a ground of appeal - The ground is deemed abandoned - And liable to be struck out (H1) *Alims Nig. Ltd. v. United Bank for Africa* p. 35

APPEALS - Issue - Jurisdiction - Locus standi - Since the issue is a matter of locus standi of respondent - The same shall not be merely brushed aside - Even though it did not come up at pleadings (H2) *Intercontinental Bank Plc v. Olam Nig Ltd* p. 89

APPEALS - Issues - Proliferation - Omega Bank case - It is not the number of issues in a brief that determine the quality - Or that determine the success of an appeal (H1) *Inegbedion v. Selo-Ojemen* p. 69

APPEALS - Jurisdiction - Court - Previous judgment - Jurisdiction of trial court to make order in respect of its earlier judgment - Which is subject to appeal - Is clearly ousted (H6) *Alims Nig. Ltd. v. United Bank for Africa* p. 35

APPEALS - Practice & procedure - Pending appeal - After appeal has been entered - Appellate court shall be seised of the whole proceedings - As between the parties - Except as otherwise provided in the rules (H9) *Vab Petroleum Inc. v. Momah* p. 249

APPEALS - Retrial order - Basis - Appellate court will inter alia order retrial - Where there is error in law - That did not render trial a nullity - And it cannot also be said that there is no miscarriage of justice (H2) *Mpama v. First Bank Nig. Plc* p. 113

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW - Jurisdiction - Federal High Court - Exclusive jurisdiction is vested on the court by 1999 Constitution s. 251(1)(p)(q)(r) - Over matters in which Fed. Govt. or its agency is a party (H3) *Inegbedion v. Selo-Ojemen* p. 69

COURT PROCESSES - Abuse - Characteristics - Abuse happens when a party improperly uses judicial process - To the irritation of his opponent - In respect of multiple actions between same parties - On same subject matter (H10) *Vab Petroleum Inc. v. Momah* p. 249

COURT PROCESSES - Service - Legal practitioner - Service on counsel is as good service on party - And proof of service is unnecessary - Where defendant appears (H4) *Vab Petroleum Inc. v. Momah* p.

249

COURT PROCESSES - Service - Proof - It is wrong to say that defendant who filed defence to statement of claim - Was not served writ of summons - Because there was no bailiff's endorsement on the writ (H5) Vab Petroleum Inc. v. Momah p. 249

COURT PROCESSES - Writ of summons - Service - Proof - The act of filing a defence to the action before the original court - Is enough to establish service of the process on respondent (H3) Vab Petroleum Inc. v. Momah p. 249

COURTS - Evidence - Evaluation - Finding of fact involves perception and evaluation - And it is not for appeal court to evaluate evidence - As that is primary duty of trial court (H1) Odutola v. Mabogunje p. 161

COURTS - Foreign court - Jurisdiction - Determination - By Foreign Judgment (Reciprocal Enforcement) s. 6 - The court shall inter alia have jurisdiction - Where judgment is given in action in personam (H2) Vab Petroleum Inc. v. Momah p. 249

COURTS - Jurisdiction - Absence of - Where court fails to pronounce whether or not it has jurisdiction - Once the law or subject matter before the court divested it of jurisdiction - Then jurisdiction does not reside in it (H1) Vab Petroleum Inc. v. Momah p. 249

COURTS - Relief - Basis for grant - Any one that asks for indulgence of court must place before it - All necessary materials which will assist court - In arriving at a just decision (H12) Vab Petroleum Inc. v. Momah p. 249

CRIMINAL PROCEDURE - Alibi - Proof - Onus is not on accused to establish alibi - To the satisfaction of court - But for prosecution to disprove it (H3) Osuagwu v. State p. 223

CRIMINAL PROCEDURE - Alibi - Time to raise - Accused must raise the defence when his caution statement is being taken - Stating clearly

the time and address of his whereabouts (H2) *Osuagwu v. State* p. 223

CRIMINAL PROCEDURE - Armed robbery - Ingredients - Proof - Prosecution must prove that there was a robbery - That accused was armed - And participated in the robbery (H4) *Osuagwu v. State* p. 223

CRIMINAL PROCEDURE - Armed robbery - Number of witnesses - Prosecution must not call a host of witnesses on same point - To prove essential elements of the crime (H5) *Osuagwu v. State* p. 223

CRIMINAL PROCEDURE - Confession - Validity - Once court is satisfied with genuineness of confession - Conviction can be based on it entirely - And such will not be disturbed on appeal (H6) *Osuagwu v. State* p. 223

CRIMINAL PROCEDURE - Conspiracy - Ingredients - It is complete upon presumed agreement by the conspirators - And court must be satisfied with evidence of complicity of accused (H8) *Osuagwu v. State* p. 223

CRIMINAL PROCEDURE - Identification parade - Relevance - It should be conducted when inter alia - Name of suspect was not mentioned at earliest opportunity - And he was not arrested at scene of robbery (H1) *Osuagwu v. State* p. 223

CRIMINAL PROCEDURE - Retrial - Principles - Abodundu's case - Retrial order is made where there has been error in law - Which neither renders the trial a nullity - Nor can court say there is no miscarriage of justice (H2) *Mohammed v. State* p. 99

CRIMINAL PROCEDURE - Right to counsel - Violation of the Constitutional right to try accused in the absence of his counsel - Is irregularity that renders the trial a nullity (H1) *Mohammed v. State* p. 99

CRIMINAL PROCEDURE - Trial within trial - When conducted - It is held when accused objects to confession - On the ground that it was

not made voluntarily (H7) *Osuagwu v. State* p. 223

DOCUMENTS - Documentary & oral evidence - Relationship - When the former supports the latter - The latter becomes more credible (H5) *Odutola v. Mabogunje* p. 161

DOCUMENTS - Signature - Expert opinion - Weight - Expert on handwriting may give his opinion on disputed signature - But final decision is made by the Judge (H3) *Odutola v. Mabogunje* p. 161

ELECTION PETITIONS - Grounds - Court - Adherence - Where petitioner relies on a ground - It will be injustice to adverse party - For court to look for other grounds to question the petition (H4) *Oshiomole v. Ehigie* p. 191

ELECTION PETITIONS - Non qualification - Pleadings - Petitioner who relies on non qualification to nullify election - Must make the issue a ground - And support same by specific pleadings (H1) *Oshiomole v. Ehigie* p. 191

EVIDENCE - Inconclusive evidence - Meaning - This means that adduced evidence does not lead to a conclusion - Or definite result (H4) *Nruamah v. Ebuzoeme* p. 133

FAIR HEARING - Breach - Effect - Once there is breach of fair hearing - The whole proceedings and decision arrived at by court - Becomes a nullity (H4) *Audu v. Federal Republic of Nigeria* p. 53

FAIR HEARING - Meaning - By 1999 Constitution s. 36(1) - Fair hearing means trial conducted according to legal rules - Formulated to ensure that justice is done to parties (H3) *Audu v. Federal Republic of Nigeria* p. 53

FAIR HEARING - Test - Okafor's case - True test of fair hearing is the impression of a reasonable man present at the trial - Whether from his observation - Justice has been done in the case (H1) *Mpama v. First Bank Nig. Plc* p. 113

JUDGMENTS - Declaratory judgment - Execution - As judgment of trial court in suit no. HAU/72/95 was declaratory - There is nothing in it that required application for stay of execution (H7) Alims Nig. Ltd. v. United Bank for Africa p. 35

JUDGMENTS - Default judgment - Failure to appeal - Since there is no appeal to set aside the foreign judgment - Supreme Court will not be of any assistance - To party who willingly abdicate his responsibility (H7) Vab Petroleum Inc. v. Momah p. 249

JUDGMENTS - Foreign judgment - Registration time - The judgment is registered within twelve months after the judgment - And within such longer period - As the High Court will allow (H11) Vab Petroleum Inc. v. Momah p. 249

JURISDICTION - Fundamental nature - Jurisdiction should be determined once raised - Since if court lacks jurisdiction to hear and determine case - The proceedings remain a nullity ab initio (H5) Alims Nig. Ltd. v. United Bank for Africa p. 35

JURISDICTION - Issue of - Court - Suo motu raising - Where court raises jurisdiction suo motu - It is proper to invite address of both counsel - Before deciding one way or the other (H3) Alims Nig. Ltd. v. United Bank for Africa p. 35

JURISDICTION - Issue of - Time to raise - Jurisdiction can be taken at any stage of proceedings - Even before Supreme Court for the first time (H2) Alims Nig. Ltd. v. United Bank for Africa p. 35

JURISDICTION - Suo motu raising - Failure to invite counsel - Failure to invite address of counsel - Does not render decision a nullity - Unless it is shown that the decision is incorrect (H4) Alims Nig. Ltd. v. United Bank for Africa p. 35

LAND LAW - Customary law - Arbitral panel - Since nothing in the law shows that the arbitrators constituted judicial tribunal - Court of Appeal rightly affirmed findings of trial court on the panels (H6) Nruamah v. Ebuzoeme p. 133

LAND LAW - Customary pledge - Principles - Okoiko's case - A pledge is perpetually redeemable - And pledgee is not entitled to compensation - For putting the land to economic uses (H3) Achilihu v. Anyatonwu p. 1

LAND LAW - Customary pledge - Validity - Admission by plaintiff and evidence of PW3 under cross examination - Strengthened defendant's claim - That the land was pledged by family head (H5) Achilihu v. Anyatonwu p. 1

LAND LAW - Family land - Sale - The family head acts as trustee of the land - And he cannot transfer the land - Without the consent of principal members of the family (H1) Achilihu v. Anyatonwu p. 1

LAND LAW - Pledge - Redemption time - Length of time of redeeming the land - Or the use it has been put to by pledgee - Is not necessary and cannot be relied on in proof of anything (H2) Achilihu v. Anyatonwu p. 1

LAND LAW - Pledgee - Duties of - He is to take proper care of the pledged property - And to deliver it to pledgor - When the debt is repaid (H4) Achilihu v. Anyatonwu p. 1

LAND LAW - Title - Conflicting claims - Where claimant fails to prove title via traditional history as pleaded - He is not allowed to turn round and rely on mere acts of ownership & possession - Upon which he originally based his title (H5) Nruamah v. Ebuzoeme p. 133

LAND LAW - Title - Proof - Burden of - Plaintiff must succeed on strength of his case - And not on weakness of defence - Save where defence's case supports his case (H2) Nruamah v. Ebuzoeme p. 133

LAND LAW - Title - Proof - Title may be proved through any of the five methods - But plaintiff is not required to prove all - As it is sufficient if one is proved (H1) Nruamah v. Ebuzoeme p. 133

LAND LAW - Traditional history - Proof - A party who relies on such

INDEX OF SUBJECT MATTER IN (2013) 1 KLR xiii

history - Must plead founder of the land - Manner the land was founded - And the names of successive owners (H3) Nruamah v. Ebuzoeme p. 133

PARTIES - Action - Need for consistency - A party should be consistent in stating his case - And in proving same (H2) Oshiomole v. Ehigie p. 191

PARTIES - Court - Legal representation - Where party is represented by counsel - His physical appearance to conduct the proceeding is not necessary - Except where court orders otherwise (H6) Vab Petroleum Inc. v. Momah p. 249

PLEADINGS - Binding nature of - A party must confine himself to his pleadings - As pleaded facts must have nexus with ground (H3) Oshiomole v. Ehigie p. 191

RULES OF COURT - Fair hearing - Imo State H.C. Rules O. 37 r. 18 - Court can only properly evaluate evidence adduced - When counsel in the matter have properly summed up (H3) Mpama v. First Bank Nig. Plc p. 113

INDEX OF STATUTES & RULES

Constitution of Federal Republic of Nigeria 1999, s. 251(1)(p)(q)(r) Inegbedion v. Selo-Ojemen p. 69, s. 36 Mohammed v. State p. 99, s. 36(1) Mpama v. First Bank Nig. Plc p. 113, s. 36(1) Audu v. Federal Republic of Nigeria p. 53, s. 36(6) Intercontinental Bank Plc v. Olam Nig Ltd p. 89

Court of Appeal Rules 1981 (as amended), O. 1 r. 22 Vab Petroleum Inc. v. Momah p. 249

Court of Appeal Rules 2007, O. 17 rr. 4, 5 Audu v. Federal Republic of Nigeria p. 53, O. 4 r. 10 Vab Petroleum Inc. v. Momah p. 249

xiv INDEX OF STATUTES & RULES IN (2013) 1 KLR

Electoral Act 2010 (as amended), ss. 31(4)(5)(6), 138(1) Oshiomole v. Ehigie p. 191

Evidence Act Cap. 112 LFN 1990, s. 87 Inegbedion v. Selo-Ojemen p. 69, s. 115(2) Intercontinental Bank Plc v. Olam Nig Ltd p. 89, s. 149(b) Odutola v. Mabogunje p. 161, s. 75 Achilihu v. Anyatonwu p. 1, s. 77 Vab Petroleum Inc. v. Momah p. 249

Foreign Judgments (Reciprocal Enforcement) Act Cap. 152 LFN 1990, ss. 6(2)(a)(iv)(v), 13 Vab Petroleum Inc. v. Momah p. 249

High Court of Imo State (Civil Procedure) Rules 1988, O. 25 r. 9 Achilihu v. Anyatonwu p. 1, O. 37 r. 18, O. 26 r. 17 Mpama v. First Bank Nig. Plc p. 113

High Court Rules of Bendel State 1988, O. 8 r. 1&2 Inegbedion v. Selo-Ojemen p. 69

Lands Instruments Registration Law Cap 72 Laws of Eastern Nigeria 1968, ss. 2, 6, 15 Achilihu v. Anyatonwu p. 1

Penal Code, s. 221 (a) Mohammed v. State p. 99

Robbery & Firearms (Special Provisions) Act 1990, ss. 1(2)(a), 5(b) Osuagwu v. State p. 223

Supreme Court Act, s. 22 Nruamah v. Ebuzoeme p. 133, s. 22 Odutola v. Mabogunje p. 161

Supreme Court Rules, O. 2 r. 31(1), O. 6 r. 5(1) Intercontinental Bank Plc v. Olam Nig Ltd p. 89